ISSN: 3080-0749

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025

DOI: https://doi.org/10.64386/xhas010102, Impact Factor: 0000

RIJSSR @ 2025



The Influence of Supervision of Instruction on Teacher Effectiveness in Kunar State Universities, Afghanistan

Ismail Shinwar

CEO of RIJSSR and Lecturer of English Department, Education Faculty, Sayed Jamaluddin Afghani University, Kunar, Afghanistan.

ABSTRACT

In the educational system, one of the key components to be set up towards achieving the objectives of the university is supervision. This article examines the effect of instructional supervision on teacher effectiveness at public universities. Two research questions guided the investigation, and one null hypothesis was tested at a 0.05 level of significance. The investigation received a similar review inquiring about the plan. All 160 lecturers are from public universities. An example of 80 instructors was chosen through a balanced, convenient sampling method. The researcher adopted a questionnaire and constructed it correctly approved and whose a dependability file is 0.85 was utilized for information collection. A mean and a t-test were used to examine the information gathered. The result of the investigation shows that both internal and external supervision of instruction have positive effects on teachers' effectiveness. Because of the research of the investigation, a few suggestions were made which one of which is that there ought to be consistently supported workshops and courses for both supervisors and lecturers independently to empower them to get proficient in the expectations for instructional supervision in public universities.

Keywords: Supervision, instruction, class room, internal supervision, external supervision

Introduction

Educational institutions leaders apply instructional supervision to develop teaching and learning by giving rehearsing instructors on-going help and direction after their teacher instructor preparing programs. The conventional education management of a country is the important institutional component used for creating human abilities and information. The ministry of higher education of Afghanistan presents to the part in key address and has the general responsibility regarding training segment strategy detailing, arranging, checking, and assessment. Education is additionally the foundation of any countries' financial, social, strict, and political turn of events (Ikegbusi and Iheanacho, 2016). Anyhow, all the different degrees of education (youth, pre-essential, essential/fundamental, post-essential/optional, and tertiary), including the educational foundations must be appropriately controlled and overseen so as to create energetic profits of students that will contribute successfully towards the national turn of events. This, basically, will incorporate

1

2*Corresponding Author: Ismail Shinwari

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025 Available at: <u>ijss-rahbar.com</u>

Page No.- 16-28

ISSN: 3080-0749

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025

DOI: https://doi.org/10.64386/xhas010102, Impact Factor: 0000

RIJSSR @ 2025



www.iiss-rahbar.com

accomplishment of a significant level of academic greatness, which involves the teaching of the correct sort of information, abilities, qualities, and mentalities to the student to empower him to work proficiently and successfully inside the general public, and guarantee cultural endurance (Oyedeji, 2012).

Furthermore, supervisors are capable to supervise student's issues and evaluate their comprehension while giving answers at the same time, they can see the troubles confronting the understudies and construct techniques and they assemble self-idea and self-viability for their students, they affect their students result and lead the students through testing assignments and they have content information (Hattie, 2003). Likewise, education planned for achieving the relative changes in the conduct of the student because of learning. Instructors are the foundation of the whole training framework (Olorunfemi, 2008).

Although, it is accepting that good supervision of instructors prompts proficient development and improvement in their techniques for the way to deal with guidance. Instructing is a procedure or demonstration of orderly exercises which includes forming the character of the student who is a mind-boggling animal, to get help to him and the general public where he gets himself. The supervision as the greatest improvement of the educator into the most expertly productive and successful individual he is equipped for turning out to be(Ogbo2015). This definition perceives that a teacher has possibilities that required assistance, direction, and coordinating. Walker (2016) and Clark (2015) then again consider that supervision to be a duty of improving guidance through customary observing and in-administration training of teachers. These definitions, in this manner, as indicated by Eya and Leonard (2012) show that supervision is tied in with advancing administration and instructor development in educational practices. The problem of the study put being referred to shape is: which of the two methods of supervision has a progressively positive effect on teachers' effectiveness in Kunar State universities? Supervisor of university and classroom guidance is apparently failing to receive any notice among Supervisor of university and underestimated however unexpectedly accentuated by the ministry of higher of Afghanistan.

Research questions

- 1. What is the level of supervisor "supervision of instruction" in public universities?
- What is the level of lecturers' effectiveness of teaching in public universities? 2.
- Is there a relationship between supervisor "supervision of instructional and lecturers" performance in public universities?

2

Research Hypothesis

2*Corresponding Author: Ismail Shinwari

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025 Available at: ijss-rahbar.com

ISSN: 3080-0749

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025

DOI: https://doi.org/10.64386/xhas010102, Impact Factor: 0000

RIJSSR @ 2025



www.iiss-rahbar.com

The following null hypothesis is test at 0.05 level of significance.

There is no significant relationship between the supervisor instructional supervision and teacher effectiveness.

There is a significant relationship between the supervisor instructional supervision and H1: teacher effectiveness.

Literature Review

According to Parthy (1992), the purpose of supervision is to enhance instruction through ongoing teacher education and regular monitoring. According to Supervision to Bar (1993), the goal of the program is to provide teachers with expert guidance so that they can improve their abilities to teach effectively. Teachers' instructional activities must therefore be supervised, guided, and directed by supervisors in accordance with professional conduct. Gagne asserts (1977:26): guidance implies orchestrating the states of discovering that are outside of the student. These conditions must be constructed stage by stage, taking into account the learner's newly acquired capabilities, retention requirements, and the particular circumstance required for the subsequent stage of learning at each stage. Oceanside and Reinhartz (2000:8), characterized oversight of guidance as "a perplexing cycle that includes working with instructors and different instructors in a collegial, cooperative relationship to improve the nature of educating and advancing inside universities and that advances the vocation long improvement of educators". According to Nwokafor (1987), the supervisor's primary responsibility is to facilitate the teachers' ability to bring about the desired changes in their students in accordance with the particular requirements of the environment. During perception, the manager additionally searches for arranging and readiness, illustration show, educators' characters, and understudy instructor cooperation's or connections. It helps supervisors learn not only about the issues teachers are having but also about the best practices that are in place (Ogunsaju, 1983). In 2001, Oshungboye identified a few characteristics of an effective instructional supervisor. He added A good instructional supervisor must be fair, consistent, and strong-willed in his interactions with others. The supervision is considered as that period of an instructive organization that helps in the effectiveness of instruction (Okumbe 1998). The helping measure of supervision includes encouraging, supporting, directing, and helping teachers to improve their exhibition expertly. Teachers" effectiveness is indicating to exercise arrangement, the inclusion of co-curricular exercises of work, students discipline and management, advising, and direction, partaking in staff gatherings, real instructing, routine evaluation of students, support of record of work secured, and learners" records and time the management. Performance infers a blend of carrying out a responsibility adequately and effectively, with a base level of representative made interruptions (Decenzo and Robbins, 1998). In this study, instructor effectiveness is conceptualized as the degree to which the lecturer accomplishes university targets through exercise arrangements which include

2*Corresponding Author: Ismail Shinwari

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025 Available at: ijss-rahbar.com Page No.- 16-28

ISSN: 3080-0749

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025

DOI: https://doi.org/10.64386/xhas010102, Impact Factor: 0000

RIJSSR @ 2025



making plans of work, exercise designs, a record of work done, getting ready and utilizing learners" registers, real homeroom instructing, appraisal and assessment of the students, going to staff gatherings, the executives of learners" discipline, inclusion in co-curricular exercises, directing, and direction, are largely implies by which teachers" performance can likewise be accomplished.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The study utilizes a comparative review to explore configuration to gather information from university lecturer. The populace contains all universities lecturers in Kunar state, Afghanistan. A sample of 160 university lecturers are draw through a balanced outlined convenient sampling method. This part presents the research design, target populace of the research, sample size, sampling technique, instruments, validity and reliability, information gathering methodology, analysis of data, moral thought, and limitation of the research. As indicated by Nwankwo (2013), separated inspecting guarantees the portrayal of each layer. The instrument that is utilize for information assortment was a questionnaire with fourteen closed-ended questions. The information gathered is utilized to register the unwavering quality coefficient utilizing Cronbach Alpha, which yielded a dependability coefficient of 0.85, which demonstrated high interior consistency of things of the instrument. It was a 4 point like an alternative survey of Strongly Agree (SA), Agree (A), Disagrees (D), and Strongly Disagree (SD).

The information gathers to investigate utilizing mean and standard deviation for the research questions, while the null hypothesis is try at 0.05 degree of significant utilizing t-test insights. The design adopt in this research is Descriptive Correlational structure. Hereafter the job for using correlational design is to discover the connections between the two factors university supervisor' instructional supervision and teacher effectiveness". As indicated by Robinson (1976), Borg and Gall (1979), correlation study incorporate all examination extends in which an endeavor is made to find or explain connections using the correlational statistical strategies.

The researcher uses the questionnaire as an instrument for data collection called Internal Supervision Assessment Scale (ISAS) for section A which consists of 20 items, while section B was External Supervision Assessment Scale (ESAS) which equally consists of 20 items. As to the investigation of information, the researcher applied a measurable device, to be specific, Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) to dissect the accumulated information. With this package, the researcher applied descriptive statistics, frequency, notably, rate, mean, and t-test.

Findings

4

ISSN: 3080-0749

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025

DOI: https://doi.org/10.64386/xhas010102, Impact Factor: 0000

RIJSSR @ 2025



Table 1: Mean rating, standard deviation of scores on the impact of internal supervision on teacher effectiveness

Descriptive Stat	istics		
ITEMS	Mean	Std. Deviation	R
Q.1	1.3875	.73766	Α
Q.2	1.3750	.64386	А
Q.3	1.4500	.69172	А
Q.4	1.7125	.90279	Α
Q.5	1.5250	.74587	Α
Q.6	1.5125	.71146	Α
Q.7	1.4625	.71057	Α
Q.8	1.4875	.69344	А
Q.9	1.5500	.82523	Α
Q.10	1.4750	.71112	А
Q.11	1.4125	.63033	Α
Q.12	1.5125	.65591	А
Q.13	1.4625	.65495	А
Q.14	1.3875	.66549	Α
Q.15	1.6250	.99842	Α
Q.16	1.4875	.71146	А
Q.17	1.4875	.72903	Α
Q.18	1.6000	.66751	Α
Q.19	1.5375	.67400	А
Q.20	1.5000	.77948	А
Grand X	1.4975	.7270	Α

The provided table presents descriptive statistics for various aspects of internal supervision in an educational context. Here's a breakdown of the information:

- Items: Each row represents a specific aspect or statement related to internal supervision.
- **Mean:** This column indicates the average score for each item, representing the respondents' overall agreement or disagreement with the statements. Higher mean values suggest stronger agreement.

2*Corresponding Author: Ismail Shinwari

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025 Available at: <u>ijss-rahbar.com</u> Page No.- 16-28

ISSN: 3080-0749

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025

DOI: https://doi.org/10.64386/xhas010102, Impact Factor: 0000

RIJSSR @ 2025



www.iiss-rahbar.com

- **Std. Deviation:** It shows the variability or dispersion of responses around the mean for each item. Lower values indicate less variability in responses.
- R: This column seems to denote the range of responses or categories for each item. It could indicate the scale or response options used in the survey, but it's not explicitly labeled.

Here are some observations from the descriptive statistics:

The mean values for most items range from approximately 1.375 to 1.7125, indicating a tendency towards agreement with the statements regarding internal supervision. The standard deviations vary across items, suggesting differing levels of agreement or variability in responses. Item 4 ("Internal supervision encourages teachers to create a democratic climate while teaching") has the highest mean value (1.7125), indicating stronger agreement compared to other items. Item 15 ("Internal supervision equips teachers with the knowledge of university's program studies") has the highest standard deviation (0.99842), suggesting more variability in responses for this statement compared to others. The grand mean (Grand X) for all items is 1.4975, with a standard deviation of 0.7270. Overall, these descriptive statistics provide insights into the perceptions of individuals regarding the role and effectiveness of internal supervision in various aspects of teaching and professional development.

Table 2: Mean rating, standard deviation of scores on the impact of external supervision on teacher effectiveness

Descriptive Statistics

ISSN: 3080-0749

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025

DOI: https://doi.org/10.64386/xhas010102, Impact Factor: 0000

RIJSSR @ 2025



www.ijss-rahbar.com

Items	Mean	Std. Deviation	R	
Q.21	1.7722	.87632	A	
Q.22	1.5000	.84194	A	
Q.23	1.7000	.94668	Α	
Q.24	1.5375	.84109	A	
Q.25	1.5250	.91368	А	
Q.26	1.5750	.89690	Α	
Q.27	1.6125	.86410	Α	
Q.28	1.4875	.81121	Α	
Q.29	1.4750	.77908	Α	
Q.30	1.5750	.92470	Α	
Q.31	1.6250	.93287	Α	
Q.32	1.5625	.96579	Α	
Q.33	1.4500	.72740	Α	
Q.34	1.4875	.81121	A	
Q.35	1.5000	.77948	Α	
Q.36	1.5250	.81092	Α	
Q.37	1.5500	.85536	A	
Q.38	1.5500	.92641	A	
Q.39	1.4375	.80887	Α	
Q.40	1.5000	.81131	A	
Grand X	1.5474	.8563	A	

The provided table presents descriptive statistics for various aspects of external supervision in an educational context. Here's an overview of the information:

- **Items:** Each row represents a specific aspect or statement related to external supervision.
- Mean: This column indicates the average score for each item, reflecting the respondents' overall agreement or disagreement with the statements. Higher mean values suggest stronger agreement.
- **Std. Deviation:** It shows the variability or dispersion of responses around the mean for each item. Lower values indicate less variability in responses.

ISSN: 3080-0749

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025

DOI: https://doi.org/10.64386/xhas010102, Impact Factor: 0000

RIJSSR @ 2025



www.iiss-rahbar.com

R: This column appears to denote the range of responses or categories for each item. It likely represents the scale or response options used in the survey, but it's not explicitly labeled.

Here are some observations from the descriptive statistics:

The mean values for most items range from approximately 1.4375 to 1.7722, indicating a tendency towards agreement with the statements regarding external supervision. The standard deviations vary across items, suggesting differing levels of agreement or variability in responses. Item 21 ("External supervision keeps teachers alert and orderly in their work behaviors") has the highest mean value (1.7722), indicating stronger agreement compared to other items. Item 23 ("External supervision identifies sources of instructional materials for teachers they supervise") has the highest standard deviation (0.94668), suggesting more variability in responses for this statement compared to others. The grand mean (Grand X) for all items is 1.5474, with a standard deviation of 0.8563. Overall, these descriptive statistics provide insights into the perceptions of individuals regarding the role and effectiveness of external supervision in various aspects of teaching and professional development.

Table 3: T-test comparison of internal and external supervision on teacher effectiveness

One-Sample Test									
	Test Value = 0.05								
		Inte			5% Confidence nterval of the Difference				
	t	df	One- Sided p	Two-Sided	Mean Difference	Lower	Upper		
Internal Supervision mean	78.110	19	<.001	<.001	1.44750	1.4087	1.4863		
External supervision Mean	81.691	19	<.001	<.001	1.49736	1.4590	1.5357		

The provided table presents the results of a one-sample t-test comparing the mean scores of internal supervision and external supervision against a test value of 0.05. Here's a breakdown of the information:

2*Corresponding Author: Ismail Shinwari

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025 Available at: ijss-rahbar.com Page No.- 16-28

ISSN: 3080-0749

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025

DOI: https://doi.org/10.64386/xhas010102, Impact Factor: 0000

RIJSSR @ 2025



- t: This column displays the calculated t-value for each type of supervision.
- **df:** It represents the degrees of freedom associated with the t-distribution.
- **Significance:** This column indicates the significance level of the t-test, often denoted as a p-value. The significance level is <.001, suggesting that the difference between the mean scores of internal and external supervision is statistically significant.
- **Mean Difference:** It shows the difference between the mean scores of internal and external supervisions.
- 95% Confidence Interval of the Difference: This interval provides a range within which the true difference between the mean scores of internal and external supervision is likely to fall with 95% confidence.
- One-Sided p and Two-Sided p: These columns represent the p-values associated with one-sided and two-sided tests, respectively.
- Lower and Upper: These values represent the lower and upper bounds of the confidence interval.

The results indicate that both internal and external supervision have significantly different mean scores, with external supervision having a slightly higher mean score compared to internal supervision. This suggests that participants rated external supervision slightly more positively than internal supervision. However, further interpretation would depend on the specific context and objectives of the study.

Summary of findings:

From the result the below result are made:

ISSN: 3080-0749

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025

DOI: https://doi.org/10.64386/xhas010102, Impact Factor: 0000

RIJSSR @ 2025



www.iiss-rahbar.com

- 1. There is a significant impact of internal supervision on teacher effectiveness in public universities in Afghanistan.
- 2. External supervision has a positive impact on teacher's effectiveness in public universities in Afghanistan.

Discussion of findings:

Impact of internal supervision on teacher effectiveness in public universities in Afghanistan

Research question 1 aimed to investigate the influence of internal supervision on teacher effectiveness in public universities in Afghanistan. The findings revealed a highly positive response from teachers of public universities in Afghanistan regarding the impact of internal supervision on their effectiveness. This suggests that principals responsible for internal supervision are performing exceptionally well in this role. The positive effects of internal supervision on teacher effectiveness encompass various aspects such as assistance in clarifying university policies, strategies for effective curriculum implementation and delivery of instruction, teaching skills acquisition, and educational leadership. These findings are consistent with the perspectives of Eya & Leonard (2012), Okobia (2015), and Ofojebe (2007), who concluded that internal supervision is more competent, knowledgeable, and effective, leading to enhanced instructional performance among teachers. Jonesboro (2013) also supported these findings by highlighting the effectiveness of internal supervision, emphasizing its reliance on voluntary shared responsibility and mutual goal-setting. Additionally, Olatoye (2006) observed that internal supervision provides teachers with necessary information and suggestions for improving their instructional practices.

Impact of external supervision on teacher effectiveness in public universities in **Afghanistan**

Research question 2 aimed to investigate the influence of external supervision on teacher effectiveness in public universities in Afghanistan. The findings revealed that the teachers of public universities in Afghanistan, among other aspects, rated highly the aspects where external supervision keeps teachers vigilant and disciplined in their work habits, actively participates in resolving instructional issues, and fosters the professional development of teachers. These results align with the findings of Modebelu (2008) and Walker (2016), who highlighted the effectiveness of external supervision due to teachers' perception of external supervisors as knowledgeable individuals with the authority to impose penalties such as salary deductions, delayed promotions, and issuance of queries. Additionally, Ughamadu (2015) supported these findings by indicating that external supervision has assisted teachers in effectively managing students and has significantly improved the teaching and learning environment. This high regard for external supervision compels teachers

2*Corresponding Author: Ismail Shinwari

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025 Available at: ijss-rahbar.com Page No.- 16-28

ISSN: 3080-0749

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025

DOI: https://doi.org/10.64386/xhas010102, Impact Factor: 0000

RIJSSR @ 2025



to maintain readiness and organization in their work practices to avoid potential consequences from external supervisors that could hinder their professional advancement opportunities.

Conclusion

From the preceding discussion, the following conclusions are underscored. The lecturers in public universities in Afghanistan perceive both internal and external supervision as positively impacting teacher effectiveness in public universities in Afghanistan. This implies that both forms of instructional supervision significantly affect the effectiveness of sec public universities in Afghanistan. Hence, the implementation of both internal and external supervision proves cost-efficient and should be maximized for optimal gains within the educational system, fostering enhancements in teaching and learning.

Recommendations

Based on the findings of the study, the following recommendations are put forward:

- 1. Regular workshops and seminars should be conducted for teachers to educate them on the importance of supervision and the expected conduct during such sessions.
- 2. Ongoing workshops and seminars should be sponsored for supervisors in the local government areas to enhance their knowledge and performance.
- 3. It is essential to foster a positive and friendly relationship between supervisors and teachers to ensure constructive supervision.
- 4. Both internal and external supervisors should be familiar with the challenges faced by supervisors, particularly those that hinder effective supervision.
- 5. Adequate facilities and instructional materials should be provided to all universities to establish an efficient and functional university system conducive to effective supervision.
- 6. Principals and other internal supervisors should prioritize the development of evaluation skills during supervision.
- 7. External supervisors should conduct thorough inspections of universities to identify resource deficiencies, enabling the identification of unused resources for classroom use.
- 8. Parents and the community should be actively engaged in the supervision of instruction within the university system to foster collaboration and enhance overall effectiveness.

References

Todaro, M. P. (1982). Economics for a developing world: An introduction to principles, problems and policies for development (No. HD 82. T63 1982).

2*Corresponding Author: Ismail Shinwari

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025 Available at: <u>ijss-rahbar.com</u> Page No.- 16-28

ISSN: 3080-0749

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025

DOI: https://doi.org/10.64386/xhas010102, Impact Factor: 0000

RIJSSR @ 2025



www.ijss-rahbar.com

- Carron, G., & De Grauwe, A. (1997). Current issues in supervision: a literature revi.
- Hoy, W. K., & Forsyth, P. B. (1986). Effective supervision: Theory into practice. Random House,
- Ikegbusi, N. G., & Iheanacho, R. C. (2016). Factors militating against effective administration of secondary schools in Anambrastate. World Journal of Educational Research, 3 (1), 1, 14.
- Oyedeji, N. B. (2012). Supervision and standard of education in Nigerian secondary schools. Retrieved September 18, 2012, from World Wide Web.
- Modebelu, M. N. (2008). Supervisory behaviour and teacher satisfaction in secondary schools. Nigerian Journal of Educational Management, 7(1), 1-12.
- Gay, L. R., Mills, G. E., & Airasian, P. W. (2009). Educational research: Competencies for analysis and applications. Merrill/Pearson.
- Olatoye, B. K. (2006). Supervision of instruction: A development approach. Ibadan: Gobek Publishers.
- Olorunfemi, D. O. (2008). Challenges of instructional supervision in the new millennium: Implication for effective planning. Journal of multidisciplinary studies, 3(2), 68-80.
- Ogba, F. N., & Igu, N. C. (2014). Realizing quality education in Nigeria: The need to revitalize secondary education. Journal of Education Research, 2, 57-64.
- Okorji, P. N., & Ogbo, R. N. (2013). Effects of modified clinical supervision on teacher instructional performance. Journal of Emerging Trends in Educational Research and Policy Studies, 4(6), 901-905.
- Walker, J. W. (2016). Supervision of instruction and school management.
- Clark, C. M. (1992). Teachers as designers in self-directed professional development. Understanding teacher development, 75-84.
- Ekundayo, H. T., Oyerinde, D. O., & Kolawole, A. O. (2013). Effective supervision of instruction in Nigerian secondary schools: Issues, challenges and the way forward. Journal of Education and practice, 4(8), 185-190.
- Okobia, T. A. (2015). Approaches to supervision of instruction, education and development. Journal of the Nigerian Educational Research Council, 2(1), 292-299.
- Firz, C. K. (2006). Supervision for increased competence and productivity: Principles and practice.
- Ko, J., & Sammons, P. (2013). Effective Teaching: A Review of Research and Evidence. CfBT Education Trust. 60 Queens Road, Reading, RG1 4BS, England.
- Wu, V., & Short, P. M. (1996). The relationship of empowerment to teacher job commitment and job satisfaction. Journal of Instructional Psychology.
- Okendu, J. N. (2012). The influence of instructional process and supervision on academic performance of secondary school students of Rivers State, Nigeria. Academic Research International, 3(1), 332.
- Mathias, P. M., Naheiri, T., & Oh, E. M. (1989).
- Borg, W. R., & Gall, M. D. (1979). An introduction to educational research. A density correction for the Peng—Robinson equation of state. Fluid Phase Equilibria, 47(1), 77-87.

ISSN: 3080-0749

Volume 01 Issue 01 (Jan) 2025

DOI: https://doi.org/10.64386/xhas010102, Impact Factor: 0000

RIJSSR @ 2025



www.ijss-rahbar.com

Orodho, A. J. (2004). Techniques of writing research proposal and reports in education and science. Reata Printers Nairobi. Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.

Vilkinas, T., Shen, J., & Cartan, G. (2009). Predictors of leadership effectiveness for Chinese managers. Leadership & Organization Development Journal.